

MINUTES - WORKFORCE COMMITTEE

Date:	Wednesday 24 July 2019	Time:	11:00 – 13:00
Venue:	Conference Room, Field House, BRI	Chair:	Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director

Present:	<p>Non-Executive Directors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director (SU) - Mr Jon Prashar, Non-Executive Director (JP) - Mr Amjad Pervez, Non-Executive Director (AM) <p>Executive Directors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Pat Campbell, Director of Human Resources (PC) - Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse (KD) - Dr Bryan Gill, Chief Medical Officer (BG)
In Attendance:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Jacqui Maurice, Head of Corporate Governance (JM)

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
W.7.19.1	Apologies for Absence	
W.7.19.2	<p>Declarations of Interest</p> <p>There were no interests declared.</p>	
W.7.19.3	<p>Unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held on 26 June 2019</p> <p>W.6.19.8 – Nurse Staffing Data Publication Report – Heat Map. Remove the two actions in the minutes for KD as these were not actions.</p> <p>The Committee agreed the minutes were a correct record.</p>	
W.7.19.4	<p>Matters Arising</p> <p>The Committee confirmed that the actions identified as completed on the action log were now closed. The following updates with regard to the open actions were noted.</p> <p>W.5.19.12 – Board Assurance Framework The Committee agreed to make a proposal to the Board of a green RAG rating in the highlight report – <u>Action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.5 – Strategic Risks relevant to the committee PC to discuss with TC the content of the paper to Board on 11 July re Industrial Action – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.8 – Nurse Staffing Data Publication Maternity Staffing Review update to be presented to Board in July – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.18 – Matters to escalate to the Board of Directors Questions to be raised at Board on which Committee should be the assuring committee for the Digital Strategy. JM to confirm outcome. Action to remain</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>open.</p> <p>W.4.19.14 – BAF Proposed Board Development Session – Communications Strategy Proposal added to the October Board Development Session schedule – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.20 – Agenda items for Workforce Committee Agenda 24 July – Visit to Simulation Centre JM apologised to the Committee as the booking for the visit had been made on the wrong date. JM to speak with TC to see if the session can be moved to a Board meeting day so that a visit can take place within that programme. JM to search for a suitable date to add to Board schedule. Action to remain open.</p> <p>W.6.19.20 – Agenda items for Workforce Committee Agenda 24 July Interim People Plan to be added to July agenda – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.15 – AOB – Wholly Owned Subsidiary PC to discuss with MH about adding Workforce Committee as an assuring Committee for the WOS risk ID 3350. Risk reviewed – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.5.19.19 – Agenda items for 26 June 2019 Strategic Objective 4 to be added to the June agenda. Discussion at Quality Committee deferred to the June meeting therefore discussion at Workforce Committee deferred until July. Added to July agenda – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.2.19.9 – Workforce Report – Workforce Dashboard Reflect any changes in the metrics and measures and align with the BAF from April 2019. PC noted that some changes have been made but further changes may be made after discussion at the Executive Timeout on 25 July – <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.8 – Nurse Staffing Data Publication Report – Heat Map KD to discuss with CF a way to adapt and improve the dashboard to also include headers on all pages - <u>action closed</u></p> <p>W.6.19.8 – Nurse Staffing Data Publication Report – Ward Accreditation – KD to meet with MM to review the accreditation documents – <u>action closed</u>.</p> <p>Other matters arising - Workforce Committee Annual Report 2018/19 The Committee noted that following discussion between TC and the Chairman, all committee annual reports would be deferred to the August Committee meetings to allow for meaningful and considered reports to be produced as a consequence of the significant changes to the terms of reference earlier in the year. TC will be working on the production of the annual reports in consultation with the Committee chairs.</p>	JM
W.7.19.4.1	<p>Matters Arising from the Board of Directors</p> <p>There were no matters arising.</p>	

W.7.19.4.2	Matters Escalated from the Sub Committee There were no matters escalated.	
W.7.19.5	Strategic Risks relevant to the Committee SU drew attention to the risks specific to this Committee as highlighted within the document and all agreed to remain sighted on the risks during discussions. ID 2968 – Reduced Consultant Medical Staffing in Microbiology– to be discussed within the Workforce Report at agenda item W.7.19.9 ID 3369 – Infectious Disease service - to be discussed within the Workforce Report at agenda item W.7.19.9 ID 3378 – De-escalation in relation to and restraint of violent and aggressive patient – KD gave an update on this risk which had seen significant improvement and it was hoped that this risk will be mitigated by the next reporting deadline. ID 3263 – Health and safety training incorporating medical devices training and manual handling – BG gave an update on this risk which has a clear action plan to mitigate which will ensure compliance with NAMDET standards with a view to being resolved by September 2019. ID 3359 - The implications of a 'no deal' EU Exit – ongoing. ID 3349 & 3350 – Wholly Owned Subsidiary – PC gave an update and noted that we had one week of industrial action. Following that week a discussion took place with UNISON to see if there was any scope to resolve the issue. UNISON and the Trust remained at a total impasse and the only acceptable way forward from their perspective was for the Trust to shelve their plans or to agree to an indefinite pause. Staff have been advised of a further period of industrial action from 1 August for 2 weeks with the possibility of a formal notice for continued strike action. A session was held last week in the Sovereign Lecture Theatre in which all staff were invited to discuss the WOS. Approximately 220 staff attended which was a difficult meeting. In total there are 560 staff who would be affected by the transfer, 360 staff have taken industrial action. UNISON are providing strike pay of £25 per day plus hardship payments and a crowd funding page has been set up. SU suggested that a representative from Northumbria hospital attend one of the sessions in the Sovereign Lecture Theatre to give their experience on their WOS transfer. PC confirmed that this had been explored but that Northumbria had declined the invitation. Work is ongoing to plan for the next period of strike action and as far as possible we are planning to use managed service contracts to cover the areas required. BTHFT staff have provided volunteer cover and have done an excellent job. The view is that we can use staff volunteers as top ups if required but it is difficult to use staff volunteers to cover the whole service. The committee discussed the financial implications of contracting out but PC confirmed that there are lost wages to off-set the cost and she was	

	<p>expecting more definitive information would be available from the Finance Department next week.</p> <p>KD raised the issue of the standards of cleaning throughout the strike period and if this standard is not maintained throughout the hospital then this is a potential patient safety risk. The Committee noted that any issues will be highlighted in future Infection Control Reports.</p>	
W.7.19.6	<p>Board Assurance Framework</p> <p>SU asked if the Committee was satisfied the necessary controls and mitigations were in place to cover the areas of concern that have been highlighted and discussed at the meeting. The Committee felt confident that progress was being made across a range of key workforce indicators and that they had received evidence demonstrating tangible assurance.</p>	
W.7.19.7	<p>Board Assurance Framework – 12 month formal review: Strategic Objective 4</p> <p>A request was made from the Board of Directors that each of the Committees spend time reviewing this particular objective. In particular to see if there is a role within the Workforce Committee to consider this in a routine way. BG confirmed that as a Workforce Committee we constantly look at the learning and how we apply that to practice and share this information. He suggested embedding learning into each strategic objective e.g. provide best quality, education and training rather than having it as a stand alone item. SU suggested that it stays as a stand alone item but is incorporated into each committee as an area to feed into.</p> <p>The Committee noted that this feedback will inform the discussion to be held about the Strategic objectives at the Board development session in October.</p>	
W.7.19.8	<p>Workforce Committee Dashboard</p> <p>The Committee discussed the dashboard in detail. The following key themes were noted:-</p> <p><u>Appraisal performance</u> – As at the end of June we have maintained our appraisal performance at 90% which was our target for the end of June. Work ongoing with CBU's to achieve the 95% target by the end of December. SU asked what would be the impact on appraisals due to staff striking. PC confirmed that currently Facilities is at 95% and Estates 93% appraisal rates and these would be mapped through in future reports.</p> <p><u>Staff Friends and Family</u> – Q1 results have seen a positive move on both the treatment and the work question. Benchmarking results aren't available until the 22nd August so we don't know how we compare but in terms of overall trajectory that is positive movement on both those indicators. We have seen an improved response rate this time which is still low but has improved from 336 to 460 staff who participated.</p> <p><u>Sickness</u> – for the first month have seen a small reduction in 'year to date' sickness absence. Benchmarking data shows how we compare with Yorkshire and Humber Trusts and our sickness rates are higher in comparison. The Model Hospital data which is included in the overarching Workforce Report hasn't been updated and still showing November 2018 date so we are continuing to use NHS Digital data. Issue remains with short term sickness and we are still seeing high sickness rates with Health</p>	

	<p>Care Assistants. PC to discuss further with KD.</p> <p><u>Nursing Care</u> – KD noted that these remain relatively stable but from a nurse staffing point of view the biggest issue is short term sickness particularly within Midwifery & Maternity.</p> <p><u>Agency staffing</u> - small increase in agency usage in the last month primarily in registered nursing and in the areas where we have recruitment difficulties. Agency usage is still low compared to historical levels in the Trust and we are tracking well against our target.</p> <p>The Committee noted that there were no other areas of concern on the dashboard.</p>	
W.7.19.9	<p>Workforce Committee Report</p> <p>The Committee noted the paper. PC drew attention to:-</p> <p><u>Nursing and Midwifery Recruitment Update</u>- Covers the nurse vacancy rates and gives a short recruitment and retention update. Our overall vacancy rate is 12% which is improved from last year. KD confirmed that we have agreed to take part in a 5th wave NHSI and NHSE retention programme. 145 Trusts have taken part. A more detailed nursing recruitment and retention update will be provided next month by KD.</p> <p><u>AHPs and Pharmacy Recruitment</u> – showing positive position overall. Work is ongoing to recruit to the vacant posts. Most challenging area to recruit to is Specialist Radiography and a summary is shown on page 8.</p> <p>The committee discussed the patient journey/patient experience and how we can enhance this for patients to try and encourage more patients to choose BTHFT. They discussed how improvements could be made through workforce and patient flow using innovation and digital technology. BG suggested that there may be scope for our system partners to look at the potential of collaborative co-production of a pathway for patients. KD would suggest the possibility of a board development facilitated session. This would be raised with the Quality Committee.</p> <p><u>Consultant Recruitment</u> - Continues to be positive. Details of the appointments made are on page 8. Mitigations are in place for Microbiology with Harrogate Hospital now joining the Joint Venture which has the potential to give us additional access to Microbiology support. Infectious Diseases will be in a better position come September when a new consultant starts plus Paul McWinney returns from retirement.</p> <p><u>Junior Doctors Recruitment</u> – Good fill rates achieved in August. Pressure in general surgery in terms of junior rotas will improve.</p> <p><u>Pensions</u> – National and local debate ongoing regarding the impact of the annual allowance on Senior Staff in the NHS, particularly Consultants. Some evidence that performance is being affected by Consultants not picking up premium rate activity. Not much evidence is available on job plan reductions which is being kept under review. Nationally there is a pension review being undertaken which is looking at flexibilities in the NHS Pension Scheme. Impact on the Trust being quantified.</p>	Chief Nurse

	<p><u>BTHFT & University of Bolton</u> – KD discussed our collaboration work with Bolton University which is ongoing to expand our pre-registered nursing pre-registration or our nursing associates. Our first pre-registered nurses are due to arrive next year. They do a second intake of nursing associates which they will continue to do every year. Confirmation has been received that we have had £50,000 in funding from NHSI to expand our nursing recruitment placements and this has been implemented with our plans with Bolton. Some of the money will be used to develop a ‘retire and return’ mentoring programme to work with students to increase support. Work is ongoing with Bradford College to get students with the correct skills to enable them to apply for nurse training and nursing associates. SU suggested updating the website to include the links to how to apply for these training courses.</p> <p>The Committee noted the contents of this report.</p>	
W.7.19.10	<p>Interim People Plan</p> <p>PC provided the paper for information which summarises the key elements of the people plan. West Yorkshire and Harrogate have been selected as a field testing site for the Workforce Development tool and a briefing session is due to take place on the 20th August. PC noted that there is a challenging deadline of 23rd August 2019 in terms of starting to develop the Operational Workforce Plan. The final people plan won't be published until after the spending review. One of the main themes of the plan is to make the NHS the best place to work and in improving NHS leadership culture. The Committee noted that National ‘our NHS people’ tweet chats will be happening on the on the 12th August and 9th September.</p> <p>The Committee noted the contents of this report.</p>	
W.7.19.11	<p>GMC Action Plan (Obstetrics)</p> <p>BG stated that the action plan is presented to the Workforce Committee for approval prior to submission to the Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists (RCOG). This is the minimum requirement as part of the Maternity Incentive Scheme (CHST) year 2. A full report of the GMC national training survey will come to the Workforce Committee in September.</p> <p>The plan addresses the issues identified in support for the O&G trainees that have come out of the 2018 survey. It is important to note that there were huge staffing challenges in 2018.</p> <p>The committee noted the contents of the report and approved the submission of the information to the RCOG.</p>	Chief Medical Officer
W.7.19.12	<p>Maternity bi-annual staffing paper</p> <p>KD stated that the report provides the Workforce Committee with the second of the bi-annual midwifery staffing reports for 2019. There have been significant improvements over the last year in recruitment. The report also demonstrates compliance with Safety Action 5 of the Maternity Incentive Scheme (CNST) year 2 standards.</p> <p>A recommendation by the CQC was around the provision of specialist midwives for vulnerable women. Approval for a specialist midwife for vulnerable women including perinatal mental health and substance misuse</p>	

	was agreed at the Senior Leadership Meeting.	
	The Committee noted the contents of the report.	
W.7.19.13	<p>Nurse Staffing Data Publication Reports – June 2019</p> <p>KD presented the paper and asked the Committee to note:-</p> <p>The report noted AMU 1 and 4 were showing a number of incidents. Investigations are underway and appropriate actions taken. On these occasions support was not available immediately from other areas to manage the demand and patient flow.</p> <p>The Committee noted the report.</p>	
W.7.19.14	<p>Workforce Committee Terms of Reference review</p> <p>The Committee reviewed the terms of reference. With regard to attendance at the Committee, SU said it was important for people who have written a paper to be able to be invited to the meeting and present this and be part of the discussion as part of a development opportunity. As such the membership of the committee should be reviewed. JM agreed to share this feedback with TC and the Chair for the final review of all terms of reference. JM reminded the Committee of the feedback they provided at a previous meeting as to how the committee was working and noted that this would also be brought to the attention of TC and the Chair.</p>	
W.6.19.15	<p>Confirmed minutes of the Education and Workforce Sub Committee – May 2019</p> <p>The Committee accepted and noted the minutes from the meeting of the Education and Workforce Sub-Committee held on 24 May 2019.</p> <p>The Committee discussed how papers that go to the Board meetings are disseminated and cascaded to staff. SU suggested the confirmed minutes of this meeting are shared with the Education and Workforce Sub Committee. PC to action.</p>	PC
W.7.19.16	<p>Board Assurance Framework</p> <p>SU asked if the Committee was satisfied the necessary controls and mitigations were in place to cover the areas of concerns that have been highlighted and discussed at the meeting. The Committee felt confident that progress was being made across a range of key workforce indicators and that they had received evidence demonstrating tangible assurance.</p> <p>Agreed at a previous meeting to change the assurance to green for Q1 under 19/20 but the current assurance level rating is still amber. This should change to green. PC to action.</p>	PC
W.7.19.17	<p>Any Other Business</p> <p>No other business was discussed.</p>	
W.7.19.18	<p>Matters to share with other Committees</p> <p>There were no matters to share with other Board Committees.</p>	PC
W.7.19.19	<p>Matters to Escalate to the Strategic Risk Register</p> <p>The two WOS risks (ID 3349 & 3350) to include Workforce Committee as an</p>	PC

	assuring committee. PC to action	
W.7.19.20	Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors The Committee to inform the Board that it had received the Maternity Incentive Scheme report and GMC report and the committee were assured. SU to inform the Board of the suggestion for a Board development day re patient flow/patient journey mapping.	SU SU
W.7.19.21	Items for Corporate Communications Report on the positive news about the Bolton University collaboration regarding nursing associates.	KD
W.7.19.22	Agenda items for the Workforce Committee scheduled 28 August 2019 Defer Freedom to Speak up report to September meeting due to KD's absence in August. The Committee agreed. PC to provide a verbal update to the September meeting about the plans in place to continue delivery of the equality service. The committee noted that due to further impending strike action certain reports due at the August committee may need deferring.	KD PC
W.7.19.23	Date and time of next meeting 25 September 11:00-13:00	



Bradford Teaching Hospitals
NHS Foundation Trust

BRADFORD TEACHING HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST
ACTIONS FROM WORKFORCE COMMITTEE – July 2019

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
24.7.19	W.7.19.20	Matters to escalate to the Board of Directors SU to inform the Board that it had received the Maternity Incentive Scheme report and the GMC report and the committee were assured.	Chair	Board of Directors 12 September 2019	Reported to 12.9.19 Board – <u>Action closed</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.20	Matters to escalate to the Board of Directors Suggestion to the board of a board development day re patient flow/patient journey mapping.	Chair	Board of Directors 12 September 2019	Reported to 12.9.19 Board – <u>Action closed</u>
26.6.19	W.6.19.6	Workforce Committee Dashboard Staff Friends and Family – PC agreed to look into what is driving these results	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Item to be addressed through the Committee Dashboard. <u>Action closed.</u>
26.6.19	W.6.19.12 W.6.19.16	Internal Audit Plan JM agreed to discuss the timings of the E-Rostering and Junior Doctors audit as implementation had just begun.	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	To be discussed at the AAC meeting on 30 July 2019.
26.6.19	W.6.19.20	Agenda items for the Workforce Committee 24 July agenda Simulation Centre to be added to July agenda	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Session scheduled incorrectly for 31 July. Has been added to the items for consideration as part of a scheduled visit during a Board meeting day / Board development session. <u>Action concluded.</u>
26.6.19	W.6.19.20	Agenda items Changes to nurse training and work with Bolton and Bradford Universities presentation to be added to August agenda.	Chief Nurse	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Deferred to September from August. Item included on Agenda. <u>Action closed</u>

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
30.1.19 26.6.19	W.1.19.13 W.6.19.9 W.6.19.20	Update on Seven Day Service Performance against Clinical Standards for 2018 BG stated that following the completion of the audit a report will be provided to the Committee.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	26.6.19 - Agreed to be deferred to September. Item included on Agenda. <u>Action closed</u>
29.5.19	W.5.19.19	Agenda items for Workforce SU suggested inviting a local Trust to present on their friends and family data at a future Workforce Committee. PC agreed to look into this	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Local Trust's have been approached. From discussions held there is nothing additional they can share that would be of benefit to the Trust. <u>Action closed.</u>
26.6.19	W.6.19.4.2	Matters escalated from the sub committee Consultant Pensions– update back to September meeting	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	On September agenda – <u>Action closed</u>
30.1.19	W.1.19.7	Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Development Sessions BG agreed to bring a presentation on next year's Clinical Excellence Awards (CEAs) to the Workforce Committee meeting in September 2019.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Comprehensive paper presented to Board of Directors in July 2019. Presentation no longer required to be delivered to the Committee. <u>Action concluded.</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.9	KD would suggest the possibility of a board development facilitated session regarding the patient journey/patient experience and how we can enhance this for patients to try and encourage more patients to choose BTHFT. KD would suggest the possibility of a board development facilitated session to the Quality Committee.	Chief Nurse	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Item discussed at Quality Committee on 24 July. The Committee has formally suggested the item for a Board development session. <u>Action closed.</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.11	GMC Action Plan (Obstetrics) A full report of the GMC national training survey will come to the Workforce Committee in September.	Chief Medical Officer		Item added to the agenda. <u>Action closed.</u>

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
24.7.19	W.7.19.15	Confirmed minutes of the Education and Workforce Sub Committee – May 2019 Confirmed minutes of the July Workforce Committee meeting to be shared with the Education and Workforce Sub Committee.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	PC to add to E&W sub committee agenda <u>Action closed</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.16	Board Assurance Framework Current assurance level rating is still amber. This should change to green.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Updated by TC – <u>action closed</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.19	Matters to escalate to the Strategic Risk Register The two WOS risks ID 3349 & 3350 to include the Workforce Committee as an assuring committee.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Risks updated 30.8.19. <u>Action closed</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.21	Items for corporate communication Report on the positive news about the Bolton University collaboration re nursing associates.	Chief Nurse	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	
24.7.19	W.7.19.22	Agenda items for the Workforce Committee 28.8.19 Defer the Freedom to Speak Up report to September meeting due to KD absence in August.	Chief Nurse	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	Item added to the agenda – <u>Action closed</u>
24.7.19	W.7.19.22	Agenda items for the Workforce Committee 28.8.19 PC to provide a verbal update to the September meeting re the continued delivery of the equality service	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	On September agenda – <u>Action closed</u>
27.03.19	W.3.19.17	Committee Review The following should be noted and form part of the review. - The necessity of having monthly meetings of the Workforce Committee - The disproportionate level of detail contained	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 30 October 2019	26.6.19 – Board committee reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance & CA. Verbal update to be provided to August meeting

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
		<p>within papers for monthly meetings – given the level of update provided.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - If meetings remain monthly - should consideration be given to holding one longer meeting, then one shorter meeting the following month? - Committee might also like to consider holding quarterly transactional meetings and then have a 'subject-based' approach for additional monthly meetings. - Committee would benefit from wider membership. It would be beneficial for deputies to attend and present particular items <p>These points would be shared with the Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs and the BTHFT Chair to support the review when it takes place.</p>			<p>New Chair in post early May. Update to Committee 29 May 2019: Date for all Board Committee Reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs. Committee to note that further update will be provided to Workforce Committee in June 2019.</p> <p>Feedback gathered from Committee in July regarding terms of reference. TC to review with Chair. An update to be provided in October.</p>